

Lero-TR-2015-04
Mapping Study Papers discussed in:
Scoping the Challenges towards a Connected Community Healthcare Ecosystem
(CCHE) for Managing Long-Term Conditions

Noel Carroll, Catriona Kennedy, Ita Richardson

This Technical Report is based on the paper:

Carroll, N. Richardson, I., Kennedy, C. (2015). Scoping the Challenges towards a Connected Community Healthcare Ecosystem (CCHE) for Managing Long-Term Conditions, *Gerontechnology Journal*.

It contains (a) the abstract from the paper and (b) the list of Mapping Study papers identified during our research.

Abstract

Background: Societal, demographic and economic changes have encouraged us to reconsider how we deliver health and social care to older people and their families in our communities. The emergence of ‘Connected Health’ (CH), through the use of information and communication technology (ICT) has gained increased attention. CH is considered to offer the potential for cost-effective, innovative care solutions which can help to support and empower older people and family carers. In doing so there exists potential to help older people and family carers manage the impact of living with long-term conditions (LTC) at home.

Method: We undertook a mapping study to 1) identify the key challenges for older people suffering from long-term conditions and their carers and 2) explore how CH could support older people suffering from long-term conditions and their carers. This article presents a review and mapping of the current status of CH with a particular focus on the use of ICT to empower older people and their families to manage LTC.

Results: The findings identify key challenges to LTC and the drivers for the emergence of CH presented as a Connected Community Healthcare Ecosystem (CCHE). This work also provides a roadmap for future research. Moving forward there is a need to engage all key stakeholders of older people, family carers, policy makers and health care practitioners to examine alternative healthcare models alongside those who develop ICT solutions.

Keywords: Connected Health, empowerment, ICT, long-term conditions

Mapping Study papers

1. Agree, E. M., Freedman, V.A., Cornman, J.C., Wolf, D.A., and Marcotte, J.E. (2005). Reconsidering Substitution in Long-Term Care: When Does Assistive Technology Take the Place of Personal Care? *Journal of Gerontology*, Vol. 60B, No. 5, S272-S280.
2. Alemdar, H. and Ersoy, C. (2010). Wireless sensor networks for healthcare: A survey. *Computer Networks*, 54, 2688-2710.
3. Archbold, P. G., Stewart, B. J., Miller, L. L., Harvath, T. A., Greenlick, M. R., van Buren, L., ... & Hagan, J. M. (1995). The PREP system of nursing interventions: a pilot test with families caring for older members. *Research in nursing & health*, 18(1), 3-16.

4. Aarts, J. W. M., Vennik, F., Nelen, W. L., Eijk, M., Bloem, B. R., Faber, M. J., and Kremer, J. A. (2014). Personal health communities: a phenomenological study of a new health-care concept. *Health Expectations*.
5. Aujoulat, I., d'Hoore, W., and Deccache, A. (2007). Patient empowerment in theory and practice: polysemy or cacophony?. *Patient education and counseling*, 66(1), 13-20.
6. Barlow J, Singh D, Bayer S, Curry R. (2007). A systematic review of the benefits of home telecare for frail elderly people and those with long-term conditions. *Journal of Telemedicine and Telecare*; 13 (4); 172–9
7. Black, A. D., Car, J., Pagliari, C., Anandan, C., Cresswell, K., Bokun, T., McKinstry, B., Procter, R., Majeed, A., and Sheikh, A. (2011). The impact of eHealth on the quality and safety of health care: a systematic overview. *PLoS medicine*, 8(1), e1000387.
8. Blaschke, C. M., Freddolino, P. P., and Mullen, E. E. (2009). Ageing and technology: A review of the research literature. *British Journal of Social Work*, 39(4), 641-656.
9. Bodenheimer, T., Lorig, K., Holman, H., and Grumbach, K. (2002). Patient self-management of chronic disease in primary care. *Jama*, 288(19), 2469-2475.
10. Booth M, Miller E A, and Mor V. (2007). Through the looking glass: toward a brighter future for long-term care in a greying New Zealand. *New Zealand Medical Journal*; 120 (1249); U2426
11. Boulos, M. N., Wheeler, S., Tavares, C., and Jones, R. (2011). How smartphones are changing the face of mobile and participatory healthcare: an overview, with example from eCAALYX. *Biomedical engineering online*, 10(1), 24.
12. Breyer, F., Costa-Font, J., and Felder, S. (2010). Ageing, health, and health care. *Oxford Review of Economic Policy*, 26(4), 674-690.
13. Buis L. (2008). Emotional and Informational Support Messages in an Online Hospice Support Community. *CIN: Computers, Informatics, Nursing*, 26(6): 358-367.
14. Carayannis, E. G., and Campbell, D. F. (2009). 'Mode 3' and 'Quadruple Helix': toward a 21st century fractal innovation ecosystem. *International Journal of Technology Management*, 46(3), 201-234.
15. CARICT (2011). ICT based solutions for caregivers: Assessing their impact on the sustainability of long term care in an Ageing Europe. European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research– IPTS –JRCP European Commission.
16. Carretero, S., Stewart, J., Centeno, C., Barbabella, F., Schmidt, A., Lamontagne-Godwin, F., and Lamura, G. (2012). Can Technology-based Services support Long-term Care Challenges in Home Care?. Analysis of evidence from social innovation good practices across the EU CARICT Project Summary Report.
17. Carroll, N. (2012). Service Science: An Empirical Study on the Socio-Technical Dynamics of Public Sector Service Network Innovation. PhD Thesis, University of Limerick.
18. Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews (2010). Retrieved 11th February 2014 from Website: <http://www2.cochrane.org/reviews/>.
19. Cook, D., and Das, S. (2004). Smart environments: Technology, protocols and applications (Vol. 43). John Wiley and Sons.
20. Coyle, L., Fiadeiro, J. L., Hinchey, M., and Nuseibeh, B. (2010). Guest Editors' Introduction: Evolving Critical Systems. *Computer*, 43(5), 28-33.
21. da Silva, I. F., da Mota Silveira Neto, P. A., O'Leary, P., de Almeida, E. S., and de Lemos Meira, S. R. (2011). Agile software product lines: a systematic mapping study. *Software: Practice and Experience*, 41(8), 899-920.
22. Davis, F. D. (1986). A technology acceptance model for empirically testing new end-user information systems: Theory and results (Doctoral dissertation, Massachusetts Institute of Technology).

23. DeLone, W. H., and McLean, E. R. (1992). Information systems success: the quest for the dependent variable. *Information systems research*, 3(1), 60-95.
24. Etzkowitz, H. (2003). Innovation in innovation: the triple helix of university-industry-government relations. *Social science information*, 42(3), 293-337.
25. EU Commission (2010). Overview of the European Strategy in ICT for Ageing Well. October. Retrieved on 31/03/2014 from Website: [http://www.antares-cosocial.com/adjuntos/279.1-ICT%20eldery%20\(A%20Fondo%20YR\).pdf](http://www.antares-cosocial.com/adjuntos/279.1-ICT%20eldery%20(A%20Fondo%20YR).pdf)
26. European Commission (2011). How to promote active ageing in Europe. EU support to local and regional actors. European Union. Retrieved on 06/04/2014 from Website: <http://ec.europa.eu/social/BlobServlet?docId=7005&langId=en>
27. European Commission (2012). Ageing report: Europe needs to prepare for growing older. Retrieved on 22/02/2014 from Website: http://ec.europa.eu/economy_finance/articles/structural_reforms/2012-05-15_ageing_report_en.htm
28. Evans, D., and Kowanko, I. (1999). Literature reviews: evolution of a research methodology. *The Australian journal of advanced nursing: a quarterly publication of the Royal Australian Nursing Federation*, 18(2), 33-38.
29. Eysenbach, G. (2001). What is e-health? *Journal of Medical Internet Res*, 3(2), e20.
30. Fink, A. (2005). *Conducting Research Literature Reviews: From the Internet to Paper* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.
31. Gaikwad, R., and Warren, J. (2009). The role of home-based information and communications technology interventions in chronic disease management: a systematic literature review. *Health informatics journal*, 15(2), 122-146.
32. Gallagher, D., Gray, H.L., Tang, P.C., Chun Yu, P., Leung, L.Y., Wang, P.C, et al. (2007). Impact of In-Home and Perceived Stress in Chinese Caregivers: Results of a Pilot Study. *American Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry*, 15(5): 425-434.
33. Goldman, D. D., Khurin, R., Tingley, D. W., and Yee-Melichar, D. (2014). Long-Term Care at Home. *Long-Term Care Administration & Management: Effective Practices and Quality Programs in Eldercare*. Springer.
34. Gray, C., Rhona, H., and Kennedy, C. (2011). Professional boundary work in the face of change to generalist working in community nursing in Scotland. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*.
35. Greenhalgh, T., Wood, G. W., Bratan, T., Stramer, K., and Hinder, S. (2008). Patients' attitudes to the summary care record and HealthSpace: qualitative study. *BMJ*, 336(7656), 1290-1295.
36. Heeks, R. (2006). Health information systems: Failure, success and improvisation. *International journal of medical informatics*, 75(2), 125-137.
37. Hill, W.G. and Weinert, C. (2004). An evaluation of an online intervention to provide social support and health education. *CIN: Computers, Informatics and Nursing*, 22 (5), 282-288.
38. Holman, H., and Lorig, K. (2004). Patient self-management: a key to effectiveness and efficiency in care of chronic disease. *Public health reports*, 119(3), 239.
39. Horizon2020 (2014). Personalising health and care. Self-management of health and disease and patient empowerment supported by ICT (PHC-27-2015). Retrieved on 1/03/2014 from Website: <http://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/portal/desktop/en/opportunities/h2020/topics/2270-phc-27-2015.html>
40. HSE (2013). Health Service Executive – National Service Plan 2013. Retrieved on 24/03/2014 from Website: <http://ww.hse.ie/eng/services/Publications/corporate/NSP2013.pdf>

41. Huber, M., Rodrigues, R., Hoffmann, F., Gasior, K. and Marin, B. (2009), Facts and figures on long-term care – Europe and North America, European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research: Vienna.
42. Kamel Boulos, M. N., and Wheeler, S. (2007). The emerging Web 2.0 social software: an enabling suite of sociable technologies in health and health care education1. *Health Information & Libraries Journal*, 24(1), 2-23.
43. Karanikolos, M., Mladovsky, P., Cylus, J., Thomson, S., Basu, S., Stuckler, D., Mackenbach, J.P., and McKee, M. (2013). "Financial crisis, austerity, and health in Europe." *The Lancet* 381, no. 9874: 1323-1331.
44. Katz, J., Holland, C., Peace, S., and Taylor, E. (2011). A better life-what older people with high support needs value. Joseph Rowntree Foundation.
45. Kitchenham, B. A., Mendes, E., and Travassos, G. H. (2007). Cross versus within-company cost estimation studies: A systematic review. *Software Engineering, IEEE Transactions on*, 33(5), 316-329.
46. Koch, S. (2006). Home telehealth—current state and future trends. *International Journal of Medical Informatics*, 75(8), 565-576.
47. Kreps, G. L., and Neuhauser, L. (2010). New directions in eHealth communication: opportunities and challenges. *Patient Education and Counseling*, 78(3), 329-336.
48. Kringos, D. S., Boerma, W. G., Bourgueil, Y., Cartier, T., Hasvold, T., Hutchinson, A., Lember, M., Oleszczyk, M., Rotar Pavlic, D., Svab, I., Tedeschi, P., Wilson, A., Windak, A., Dedeu, T. and Wilm, S. (2010a). The European primary care monitor: structure, process and outcome indicators. *BMC family practice*, 11(1), 81.
49. Kringos, D. S., Boerma, W. G., Hutchinson, A., van der Zee, J., and Groenewegen, P. P. (2010b). The breadth of primary care: a systematic literature review of its core dimensions. *BMC Health Services Research*, 10(1), 65.
50. Kringos, D. S., Boerma, W., van der Zee, J., and Groenewegen, P. (2013). Europe's strong primary care systems are linked to better population health but also to higher health spending. *Health Affairs*, 32(4), 686-694.
51. Lam, L. and Lam, M. (2012). The use of information technology and mental health among older caregivers in Australia. *Aging and Mental Health*, 13:4, 557-562.
52. Li T, Vedula SS, Scherer R, Dickersin K. (2012). What comparative effectiveness research is needed? A framework for using guidelines and systematic reviews to identify evidence gaps and research priorities. *Ann Intern Med*;156:367-77
53. LTCAS. (2008). Long-term Conditions Alliance. Gaun Yersel! Being human: self-management strategy for long term conditions in Scotland. Long Term Conditions Alliance Scotland. Accessed on, 13(04). Retrieved on 06/04/2014 from Website: http://www.chss.org.uk/voices_scotland/documents/COSMIC_workshop_Gaun_Yersel.pdf
54. Magnusson, L., and Hanson, E. (2005). Supporting frail older people and their family carers at home using information and communication technology: cost analysis. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 51(6), 645-657.
55. Magnusson, L., Hanson, E., and Borg, M. (2004). A literature review study of information and communication technology as a support for frail older people living at home and their family carers. *Technology and Disability*, 16(4), 223-235.
56. Magnusson, L., Hanson, E., and Nolan, M. (2002). Assisting carers using the ACTION model for working with family carers. *British Journal of Nursing*, 11(11), 759-763.

57. Magnusson, L., Hanson, E., and Nolan, M. (2005). The impact of information and communication technology on family carers of older people and professionals in Sweden. *Ageing and Society*, 25(5), 693-714.
58. McMullan, M. (2006). Patients using the Internet to obtain health information: how this affects the patient–health professional relationship. *Patient education and counseling*, 63(1), 24-28.
59. Moher, D., Liberati, A., Tetzlaff, J., and Altman, D. G. (2009). Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. *Annals of internal medicine*, 151(4), 264-269.
60. Mulrow, C. D. (1994). Rationale for systematic reviews. *BMJ: British Medical Journal*, 309(6954), 597.
61. Munson, S. A., Cavusoglu, H., Frisch, L., and Fels, S. (2013). Sociotechnical Challenges and Progress in Using Social Media for Health. *Journal of medical Internet research*, 15(10).
62. Muras, J. A., Cahill, V., and Stokes, E. K. (2006, November). A taxonomy of pervasive healthcare systems. In *Pervasive Health Conference and Workshops, 2006* (pp. 1-10). IEEE.
63. Nastasi, B. K. (2000). School psychologists as health-care providers in the 21st century: Conceptual framework, professional identity, and professional practice. *School Psychology Review*.
64. Nilsson, C. J., Avlund, K., and Lund, R. (2011). Onset of mobility limitations in old age: the combined effect of socioeconomic position and social relations. *Age and ageing*, 40(5), 607-614.
65. Nolan, M.R., Brown, J., Davies, S., Nolan, J. and Keady, J. (2006). *The Senses Framework: Improving care for older people through a relationship-centred approach. Getting Research into Practice (GRIP) Series, No. 2*, University of Sheffield. Retrieved on 02/04/2014 from Website: http://shura.shu.ac.uk/280/1/PDF_Senses_Framework_Report.pdf
66. O’Leary, P., Noll, J., and Richardson, I. (2014). A Resource Flow Approach to Modelling Care Pathways. In *Foundations of Health Information Engineering and Systems* (pp. 41-58). Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
67. OECD (2014). *OECD Factbook 2013: Economic, Environmental and Social Statistics*. Retrieved on 31/03/2014 from Website: http://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/economics/oecd-factbook-2013_factbook-2013-en
68. Patterson, M., Nolan, M., Rick, J., Brown., J. and Adams., R. (2011). From metrics to meaning: Culture change and quality of acute hospital care for older people. National Institute for Health Research Service Delivery and Organisation Programme. http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/_data/assets/pdf_file/0003/64497/FR-08-1501-93.pdf
69. Petersen, K., Feldt, R., Mujtaba, S., and Mattsson, M. (2008). Systematic mapping studies in software engineering. In *12th International Conference on Evaluation and Assessment in Software Engineering*, June (Vol. 17, p. 1).
70. Pillinger, J. (2012). The future of healthcare in Ireland. Position paper on the health crisis and the government’s plans for healthcare. Retrieved on 28/02/2014 from Website: <http://www.impact.ie/files/healthpdf/reform/FutureofHealthcare.pdf>
71. Reid, L., Lotter, M., Burton, J., and Richardson, I. (2012). Designing and Implementing a Hospital Quality Assurance Program. *Software, IEEE*,29(3), 37-44.
72. Rodrigues, R., Huber, M., and Lamura, G. (2012). Facts and figures on healthy ageing and long-term care. European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research: Vienna.

73. Rossi Mori, A., Dandi, R., Mazzeo, M., and Verbicaro, R. (2012). Technological Solutions Potentially Influencing the Future of Long-Term Care. Retrieved on 25/02/2014 from Website: http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2117750
74. Royal College of Nursing (2013). Moving care to the community: an international perspective. Retrieved on 01/04/2014 from Website: http://www.rcn.org.uk/__data/assets/pdf_file/0006/523068/12.13_Moving_care_to_the_community_an_international_perspective.pdf
75. Schaper, L. K., and Pervan, G. P. (2007). ICT and OTs: A model of information and communication technology acceptance and utilisation by occupational therapists. *International journal of medical informatics*, 76, S212-S221.
76. Schulz, R. (2001). Some critical issues in caregiver intervention research. *Aging and Mental Health*, 5 (supplement 1) S112-5
77. Sharpe, L., Butow, P., Smith, C., McConnell, D., and Clarke, S. (2005). The relationship between available support, unmet needs and caregiver burden in patients with advanced cancer and their carers. *Psycho-Oncology*, 14(2), 102-114.
78. Shaw, B.R., Hawkins, R., Arora, N., McTavish, F., Pingree, S. and Gustafson, D.H. (2004) An exploratory study of predictors of participation in a computer support group for women with breast cancer. *CIN: Computers, Informatics, Nursing*, 22(5): 282-288.
79. Shura, R., Siders, R. A., and Dannefer, D. (2011). Culture change in long-term care: Participatory action research and the role of the resident. *The Gerontologist*, 51(2), 212-225.
80. Steele, R., Lo, A., Secombe, C., and Wong, Y. K. (2009). Elderly persons' perception and acceptance of using wireless sensor networks to assist healthcare. *International journal of medical informatics*, 78(12), 788-801.
81. Stoltz, P., Udén, G., and Willman, A. (2004). Support for family carers who care for an elderly person at home—a systematic literature review. *Scandinavian journal of caring sciences*, 18(2), 111-119.
82. Strandberg-Larsen, M., and Krasnik, A. (2009). Measurement of integrated healthcare delivery: a systematic review of methods and future research directions. *International Journal of Integrated Care*, 9.
83. Sum, S., Mathews, M., Pourghasem, M., and Hughes, I. (2008). Internet technology and social capital: How the Internet affects seniors' social capital and wellbeing. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 14(1), 202-220.
84. The Princess Royal Trust for Carers (2012). How can the web support carers. Retrieved on 23/02/2014 from Website: http://www.carers.org/sites/default/files/web_support.pdf
85. Thome, B., Dykes, A. K., and Hallberg, I. R. (2003). Home care with regard to definition, care recipients, content and outcome: systematic literature review. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 12(6), 860-872.
86. Torrington, J. (2009). The design of technology and environments to support enjoyable activity for people with dementia. *ALTER-European Journal of Disability Research/Revue Européenne de Recherche sur le Handicap*, 3(2), 123-137.
87. UK Department of Health (2012). Research and development work relating to assistive technology 2011-12. Retrieved on 23/02/2014 from Website: https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/216842/Research-and-development-work-relating-to-Assistive-Technology-2011-12.pdf
88. Varshney, U. (2005). Pervasive Healthcare: Applications, Challenges and Wireless Solutions. *Communications of the Association for Information Systems*, 16.
89. Weiner, C., Cudney, S. and Winters, C. (2005). Social Support in Cyberspace. The next Generation. *CIN: Computers Informatics Nursing*, 23(1): 7- 15.

90. Wherton, J. P., and Monk, A. F. (2008). Technological opportunities for supporting people with dementia who are living at home. *International Journal of Human-Computer Studies*, 66(8), 571-586.
91. Williams, A. (2011). A qualitative study of supported self-care in women with lymphoedema associated with breast cancer (Doctoral dissertation, Edinburgh Napier University).
92. World Health Organisation (2004). A Glossary of Terms for Community Health Care and Services for Older Persons. Ageing and Health Technical Report. Retrieved on 02/04/2014 from Website: http://www.who.int/kobe_centre/ageing/ahp_vol5_glossary.pdf
93. World Health Organization (2005). 58th World Health Assembly Report; 16–25 May 2005. Geneva: WHO. Retrieved on 04/04/2014 from Website: http://apps.who.int/gb/ebwha/pdf_files/WHA58-REC1/english/A58_2005_REC1-en.pdf
94. World Health Organization (2008). The Solid Facts. Home care in Europe. Rosanna Tarricone and Agis D. Tsouros (eds). Retrieved on 04/04/2014 from Website: http://www.euro.who.int/data/assets/pdf_file/0005/96467/E91884.pdf
95. Zhang, D., Yu, Z., and Chin, C. (2005). Context-aware infrastructure for personalized healthcare. *Studies in health technology and informatics*, 117, 154-163.